

THE ENDURANCE OF INEQUALITY

Race, property and spatiality in Bloemfontein and surrounds

Karin van Marle
Lochner Marais
Danie Brand
(eds)

Pretoria University Law Press
PULP

publishing African scholarship that matters
www.pulp.up.ac.za

2025

The endurance of inequality: Race, property and spatiality in Bloemfontein and surrounds

Published by:

Pretoria University Law Press (PULP)

The Pretoria University Law Press (PULP) is a publisher at the Faculty of Law, University of Pretoria, South Africa. PULP endeavours to publish and make available innovative, high-quality scholarly texts on law in Africa. PULP also publishes a series of collections of legal documents related to public law in Africa, as well as text books from African countries other than South Africa. This book was peer reviewed prior to publication.

For more information on PULP, see www.pulp.up.ac.za

Printed and bound by:

Pinetown Printers, South Africa

To order, contact:

PULP

Faculty of Law

University of Pretoria

South Africa

0002

pulp@up.ac.za

www.pulp.up.ac.za

ISBN: 978-1-0672372-3-3

© The Authors 2025

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editor's preface	v
Contributors	vi
1 Introduction <i>Lochner Marais and Karin van Marle</i>	1
2 Considering home, assets and place attachment in the urban periphery: Rethinking the spatial marginality of apartheid planning <i>Lochner Marais and Job Gbadegesin</i>	21
3 It's not the same, but it will eventually feel like home: Response to Marais and Gbadegesin <i>Motsaathebe Serekoane and Chitja Twala</i>	44
4 The endurance of apartheid notions of property law in Bloemfontein and surrounds. What does it mean today, in this place to say: 'This house is mine!?' <i>Danie Brand</i>	56
5 The endurance of apartheid notions of property law in Bloemfontein and surrounds: Response to Danie Brand <i>George Fordam Wara</i>	73
6 The trans-temporality of land ownership in South Africa <i>Gerard Emmanuel Kamdem Kamga and Isolde de Villiers</i>	87
7 The trans-temporality of land ownership in South Africa: Response to De Villiers and Kamga <i>Lindani Mhlanga</i>	110
8 Cuts and wounds: Stories of perpetual loss and insecurity <i>Phia van der Watt</i>	115
9 The psycho-social healing of a nation: A few pointers: Response to Van der Watt <i>Andries Odendaal</i>	142

10	Narrative, nomos, world(s) <i>Karin van Marle</i>	153
11	Narrative, nomos, world(s): Response to Van Marle <i>Stewart Motha</i>	173
12	Conclusion <i>Karin van Marle</i>	178

EDITOR'S PREFACE

As always with such projects, this one arises from much support and collaboration.

The erstwhile Deputy Vice-Chancellor for Research at the University of the Free State, Corli Witthuhn awarded us an Interdisciplinary Research Grant that enabled the fieldwork on which the whole project rests, as well as the authors' workshop where we shared and developed our ideas. The RAITH Foundation funded editing and Hesma van Tonder and Isabeau de Meyer did the editing expertly and quickly. Jan Cloete assisted in the research design and shepherded us through the ethical clearance process. Molefi Lenka coordinated and managed the interview process and Irene Kganare, Morake Khunong and Tumelo Machere conducted the interviews, providing us with rich and nuanced material to work on. Ulrike Kistner was generous with her time and wisdom as respondent at the authors' workshop. Our ten fellow authors were as productive, creative and patient as ever one could expect contributors to a project like this to be. Lizette Hermann from PULP assisted as best she could with the publication process. All these people deserve and receive our thanks and appreciation.

But the biggest thanks and deepest appreciation go to the interviewees, residents of Bloemfontein, Mangaung, Thaba Nchu and Botshabelo who let us vicariously into their homes and shared a small slice of their lives with us. This book is dedicated to them.

Karin van Marle, Lochner Marais and Danie Brand

CONTRIBUTORS

Danie Brand is Director of and Professor at the Free State Centre for Human Rights at the University of the Free State. His field is constitutional and administrative law and constitutional theory. His research and publications focus in particular on the relationship between law and poverty and the manner in which law regulates and so both enables and limits access to basic livelihood resources such as housing, food, water, land, medical care and education. This interest extends into legal practice, where he runs a public interest practice as advocate, focusing on housing and land issues.

Isolde de Villiers started work on this project during a post-doctoral fellowship at the Free State Centre for Human Rights of the University of the Free State. In her doctoral thesis she analysed aspects of spatial inequality in Pretoria. She has held academic positions at the University of Pretoria, University of the Free State and University of the Western Cape. She is interested in overlooked cities of South Africa, such as Bloemfontein, Mangaung. She works as researcher at the Supreme Court of Appeal in Bloemfontein and is an extraordinary professor at the Free State Centre for Human Rights of the University of the Free State.

Job Gbadegesin is a research expert at the Programme for Land and Agrarian Studies (PLAAS) at the University of the Western Cape and a research associate at the Centre for Development Support, University of the Free State, where he was also previously a post-doctoral fellow. He publishes in areas connecting property studies and built environment with much interest in the directions of property development and management, housing system policy and planning, land institution, sustainable built environment, including mining and infrastructure governance. He also has years of teaching experience in real estate generally. He earned his PhD from OTB-Research for the Built Environment, Faculty of Architecture and the Built Environment, Delft University of Technology.

Gerard Emmanuel Kamdem Kamga has a multidisciplinary background including in law, human rights, political science, critical theory and gender analysis. After working as researcher for the Centre for Sexualities, Aids and Gender at the University of Pretoria between 2017 and 2019, he joined the University of the Free State where since 2020 he is the coordinator of the Research and Postgraduate

Division at the Free State Centre for Human Rights. He is currently interested in the area of human rights and development and has numerous publications in this field.

Lochner Marais is a Professor of Development Studies at the Centre for Development Support at the University of the Free State. He is also an honorary professor at the Sustainable Minerals Institute (University of Queensland, Australia). He serves on the editorial board of *Habitat International* and is also the speciality chief co-editor for the Cities in the Global South section of the journal, *Frontiers in Sustainable Cities*. His research interests include housing policy, small cities and towns (mining and renewable towns and cities) and public health focusing on children. Marais has authored, co-authored and compiled more than 250 research reports, including 180 refereed articles in peer-reviewed journals or books, and has co-edited nine books.

Lindani Mhlanga is a post-doctoral fellow at the Free State Centre for Human Rights of the University of the Free State and a fellow of the International Association of Law Schools. His scholarship focuses on constitutional, property and land law and engages the crucial power dynamics underpinning South Africa's constitutional democracy and their bearing on socio-economic rights.

Stewart Motha is Professor of Law at Birkbeck Law School of the University of London. His current research examines law's relationship with 'nature'. This includes a critical exploration of how 'nature' is conceptualised in climate litigation and national and international environmental law, and the philosophical underpinning of the distinction between 'matter' and norms. The research is linked to questions of climate justice and legal responses to ecological crises. Stewart has also published widely on issues of post-colonial justice, law, memory and violence, and theories of sovereignty. This research has been articulated through discourses of law, philosophy and aesthetics.

Andries Odendaal is a Senior Associate at the Centre for Mediation in Africa at the University of Pretoria. He also serves on the Expert Panel of the Bureau for Crisis Prevention and Recovery of the United Nations Development Programme and the Mediation Roster of the Mediation Support Unit of the United Nations Department of Political Affairs.

Motsaathebe Serekoane is an anthropologist and teaches in the Department of Anthropology at the University of the Free State. His academic interests are focused on issues pertaining to heritage, culture and health, and the scholarship that informs transformative education. His work is interdisciplinary, cutting across various disciplinary boundaries such as social work, psychology, sociology and development studies. He understands scholarly practice as context-specific, entwined in the discovery of the knowledge of the discipline (epistemology) and focuses on the latest ideas on how to teach it (pedagogy).

Chitja Twala is a professor of history (Department of Cultural and Political Studies) at the University of Limpopo (UL) and former vice-dean (Faculty of the Humanities) at the University of the Free State. He has published widely on the history of the liberation movements. He is the recipient of Mellon Foundation and National Institute of Humanities and Social Sciences (NIHSS) grants.

Phia van der Watt became interested in the manifestations and compounding of intergenerational communal wounding as a community development practitioner. She developed a healing approach, which she now uses to facilitate conscientisation and healing with diverse groups of community members and professionals. Through her research work she reflects on how complex communal wounding is compounded by policies and practices, such as communal land claims and mining. She is a research fellow at the Centre for Development Support at the University of the Free State.

Karin van Marle currently holds a Research Chair in Gender, Transformation, Worldmaking at the University of the Western Cape. She also is an extraordinary professor at the Free State Centre for Human Rights. She has taught in the field of Critical Jurisprudence on undergraduate and post-graduate levels for many years. Several doctoral and research Master's students completed their studies under her supervision and she continues to supervise a number of post-graduate students working in the field of critical jurisprudence, law and transformation and feminist theory. Her research falls within the broad field of law and the humanities and involves critical theory, legal philosophy and jurisprudence.

George Fordam Wara is a lawyer from Kenya and a research fellow at the Free State Centre for Human Rights of the University of the Free State, where he previously was also a post-doctoral fellow. He has been studying law reform as a tool to transform the interface of dominance by the state statutory system over the customary rights of communities. He uses theoretical concepts of systems theory, social dominance and legal pluralism to test whether an interface model of recognition by the state of these communities' informal tenure rights will be effective in redressing the unhealthy competition for land resources, instabilities and conflict in the areas that they live in.