

3

Solutions for each Case Narrative

1 Introduction

For each of the clinical case narratives described in the previous chapter, this chapter provides the solutions for each case narrative in Table 3.1, which captures the legal status, the most suitable decision path in the algorithm in terms of the MHCA, and the degree of difficulty in coming to a solution for each case narrative.

2 Explanation of Table 3.1

Concordant to the case narrative number and name in the previous chapter, the second column shows for each case narrative one of the four legal status possibilities, which are: voluntary; involuntary; assisted; and decline or mental health service is not indicated.

The decision path for each case narrative is described in the third column by a list of the decision points in the algorithm where ‘yes’ is the most suitable outcome of the assessment along the decision path. For the ease of reading, only ‘yes’ is indicated whereby ‘no’ is the rule for the preceding decisions on the path up to the decision point where ‘yes’ is indicated, and the same applies for the subsequent decision points up to the legal status decision box.

An alternative decision path that may be suitable, is provided where this may arguably apply. That alternative routes may be suitable should be expected considering that a mental illness may affect one’s capacity in more than one way, and each way may vary in the extent to which one’s capacity is affected. Furthermore, the narratives and their interpretation, as may be the case practically, are not always clear about which aspect is affected most.

The order in which the decision points appear in ILSAA determines the path by which the legal status for that case is obtained. However, the incapacities that are captured in this way do not exclude other incapacities that may pertain along paths that have not been followed by virtue of the order of decision points. For example, finding that a risk of serious

harm is due to current mental illness at decision point no 28, follows the path directly to the involuntary legal status decision box. This means, however, that a risk to financial interests due to current mental illness, and/or a risk to reputation due to current mental illness (at decision points nos 32 and 36 respectively) may apply, but these decision points do not feature in the most suitable nor the alternative decision path by virtue of the first finding of a risk of serious harm due to current mental illness at decision point no 28.

The last column describes the degree of difficulty as little, moderate, substantial or much difficulty. These categories of difficulty correspond to the four statistical quartiles based on the case-specific accuracy values obtained by 294 research participants in training who applied the ILSAA 4 052 times to 135 clinical case narratives (see Annexure A). For each case narrative, the case-specific accuracy was calculated as the proportion (%) of research participants in training who assessed the legal status accurately in accordance with the gold standard. The case-specific accuracy at the 25th, 50th (median), and 75th percentiles were respectively 74.4%, 85.7% and 93.4%. Case narratives for which accuracy proportions were in the first, second, third and fourth quartiles are categorised respectively as of much, substantial, moderate, and little difficulty. When marked with an asterisk, an estimate is provided as data were not available.

Table 3.1: Solutions for each Case Narrative

Case narrative number and Name	Suitable Legal Status	Most suitable decisions on the ILSAA path	Alternative decision on the ILSAA path	Degree of Difficulty
1.1 Ms BaSe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate
1.2 Mr QaBa	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8	Much*
1.3 Ms BeHg	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little

1.4	Dr LuKo	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, 28.	None	Little
1.5	Ms SaKe	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	Moderate
1.6	Mr FeRu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 4, 6, and 24.	None	Substantial
1.7	Ms BeSo	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little
1.8	Ms BaNe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little
1.9	Mr JaLo	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	None	Moderate
1.10	Prof LuCe	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Much
1.11	Ms BaCe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little
1.12	Ms HuCe	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	None	Substantial
1.13	Mr HiSu	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate

1.14 Ms BeCi	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	Substantial
1.15 Ms QaBo	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	Moderate*
1.16 Ms Zala	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	Much*
1.17 Ms QaBe	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 4, 6, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24; or 2, 12, 14, and 24; or 2, 16, 18, and 24.	Substantial*
1.18 Mr QaBi	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate*
1.19 Ms HeRo	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate
1.20 Mr ZaLe	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	None	Much*
1.21 Ms HeVa	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Substantial
1.22 Mr WiGo	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	None	Little

1.23 Mr ZaLo	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	Moderate*
1.24 Ms HuBe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Substantial
1.25 Ms SuKo	a) Assisted b) Involuntary	a) 'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24. b) 'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	a) None b) None	Moderate
1.26 Ms HeLa	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little
1.27 Ms VeFa	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	None	Substantial
1.28 Ms Zali	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little*
1.29 Ms SeKa	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	Much
1.30 Ms HeCa	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Much
1.31 Mr SeFu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	Substantial

1.32 Ms SaLe	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1; or 'Yes' at decision point 2.	Much
1.33 Mr FuKi	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 12, 14, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28	Moderate
1.34 Mr FeRh	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Substantial
1.35 Mr HeKa	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Substantial
1.36 Ms SaNe	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32.	Little
1.37 Mr HaSe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Substantial
1.38 Mr MaFe	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 16, 18, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 4, 6, and 24.	Much
1.39 Mr HaMe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Much

1.40 Ms NePu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 4, 6, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24; or 2, 12, 14, 24; or 2, 16, 18, 24.	Substantial
1.41 Ms GaTo	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	Little
1.42 Mr SaKu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 12, 14, and 24.	Moderate
1.43 Ms HaLo	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Substantial
1.44 Ms SaFo	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	Little
1.45 Mr FuSo	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	None	Substantial
1.46 Ms FuRa	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32; or 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	Little
1.47 Mr PoTa	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	None	Substantial

1.48	2.48 Ms PeNi	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 16, 18, and 24.	Moderate
1.49	2.49 Mr FoVu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	None	Much
1.50	2.50 Mr FoSe	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	Much
1.51	2.51 Ms ReBh	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate
1.52	2.52 Ms FoRe	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	None	Substantial
1.53	Ms PaNu	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	Moderate
1.54	Mr PaGo	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	None	Moderate
1.55	Ms FoKu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	Substantial
1.56	Ms NuRa	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36; or 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32.	Little

1.57 Mr FiKu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 12, 14, and 24.	Little
1.58 Mr NuKa	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Little
1.59 Mr NiKu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	Moderate
1.60 Ms FeMu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 12, 14, and 24.	Substantial
1.61 Ms NeLu	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	Little
1.62 Mr NaRe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little
1.63 Ms FeCo	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	Moderate
1.64 Mr FaVo	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	None	Much
1.65 Mr BhCe	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	None	Substantial

1.66 Ms NaPo	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32; or 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	Little
1.67 Ms BhJe	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	Much
1.68 Ms BeNo	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	None	Much
1.69 Mr FeVi	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 24.	None	Substantial
1.70 Mr FaSo	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 16, 18, and 24.	Substantial
1.71 Mr FoVe	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32.	Substantial*
1.72 Ms HaVi	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2.	Much
1.73 Mr FaVe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Much
1.74 Ms HiLu	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2 and 8.	Much

1.75 Ms NaLu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 24.	None	Little
1.76 Mr MoHa	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2 and 8.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2.	Much
1.77 Mr FaRi	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Moderate
1.78 Ms FaMo	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Moderate
1.79 Ms FaKo	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate
1.80 Mr DeKo	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2 and 8.	None	Much
1.81 Ms DaKe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate
1.82 Ms BhMo	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2.	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1; or 'Yes' at decision points 2 and 8.	Much
1.83 Ms BuCa	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 4, 6, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32.	Moderate*

1.84 Ms BoSe	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2 and 8.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2.	Much
1.85 Mr GeWi	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	None	Moderate
1.86 Mr KaNu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 24.	None	Moderate*
1.87 Mr HuKu	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2 and 8.	None	Much
1.88 Ms KoFi	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Much
1.89 Ms KoSe	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2 and 8.	None	Much
1.90 Ms MoFi	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 12, 14, 22, 26, 34, and 36.	Substantial
1.91 Ms RoHu	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	None	Much
1.92 Mr FaKe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little
1.93 Mr RoBh	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	None	Much

1.94 Ms FaCe	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	None	Substantial
1.95 Ms LiKa	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	None	Moderate
1.96 Mr LuJe	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32.	Moderate
1.97 Ms CuRa	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Little
1.98 Ms LeKi	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Substantial
1.99 Mr CuNa	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	Little
1.100 Ms LiCa	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 4, 6, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24; or 'Yes' at decision points 2, 16, 18 and 24.	Little
1.101 Ms LeNi	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Moderate
1.102 Mr MiHu	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate

1.103 Ms CiRu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 16, 18, and 24.	Moderate
1.104 Ms CuGi	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	Moderate
1.105 Mr CiNu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	Moderate
1.106 Ms CeKu	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Little
1.107 Ms CaRe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little
1.108 Mr LeJi	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 4, 6, and 24.	Much
1.109 Ms LaKe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate
1.110 Ms CiKe	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 16, 18, and 24.	Little
1.111 Mr LaNu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	None	Substantial
1.112 Ms LaCu	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate

1.113 Mr KuSo	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Moderate
1.114 Mr BoMh	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little
1.115 Ms KuFi	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Substantial
1.116 Ms BoNi	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 4, 6, and 24.	Little
1.117 Ms KuBh	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2.	None	Much
1.118 Ms BiNu	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 34, and 36.	Substantial
1.119 Ms KiLa	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	None	Moderate
1.120 Ms KeSo	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little
1.121 Mr BiCu	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	Moderate
1.122 Mr BhMe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Substantial

1.123 Mr JiLa	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	Substantial
1.124 Ms BhKu	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate
1.125 Ms BeHj	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2.	None	Moderate
1.126 Mr BhGe	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Much
1.127 Mr KeNi	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Little
1.128 Mr KeBh	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little
1.129 Ms GeCi	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24; or 'Yes' at decision points 2, 16, 18, and 24.	Moderate
1.130 Ms ToPa	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	None	Much
1.131 Ms NoRi	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	None	Substantial
1.132 Ms NeRo	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Much

1.133 Ms FaCi	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Little
1.134 Ms CeRi	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2.	None	Much
1.135 Ms CaKu	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Substantial
1.136 Mr KeFa	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 30, and 32.	Much
1.137 Ms MuFa	Voluntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 20.	None	Moderate
1.138 Mr HeSo	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision point 2.	None	Much
1.139 Ms KuLe	Involuntary	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, 22, 26, and 28.	None	Little
1.140 Mr FoRh	Decline	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 22.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2 and 8.	Much
1.141 Mr SaCe	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	None	Substantial
1.142 Ms WoPe	Decline	'No' at algorithmic decision point no 1.	None	Much
1.143 Mr KaSo	Assisted	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 8, 10, and 24.	'Yes' at algorithmic decision points 2, 12, 14, and 24.	Much